**Porterville College Mission Statement**:

With students as our focus, Porterville College provides our local and diverse communities quality education that promotes intellectual curiosity, personal growth, and lifelong learning, while preparing students for career and academic success.

In support of our values and philosophy, Porterville College will:

1. Provide quality academic programs to all students who are capable of benefiting from community college instruction.
2. Provide comprehensive support services to help students achieve their personal, career and academic potential.
3. Prepare students for transfer and success at four-year institutions.
4. Provide courses and training to prepare students for employment or to enhance skills within their current careers.
5. Provide developmental education to students who need to enhance their knowledge and understanding of basic skills.
6. Recognize student achievement through awarding degrees, certificates, grants, and scholarships.

**Guided Pathways Framework**:

1. Clarify the Path: Create clear curricular pathways to employment and further education.
2. Enter the Path: Help students choose and enter their pathway.
3. Stay on the Path: Help students stay on their path.
4. Ensure Learning: Ensure that learning is happening with clear outcomes.

**Program Mission Statement**:

The Porterville College Distance Education (DE) Program ensures the quality and increases access for students of its classes, programs and services offered in various distance education modalities by providing and supporting faculty access to instructional design resources and professional growth opportunities, and promoting expansion of the College’s distance education programs and services.

**Service Area Outcomes (SAOs)**:

| SAO Statement | Describe assessment results and discussion of this SAO | Describe how the results impact your goals and needs going forward |
| --- | --- | --- |
| 1. Faculty will report that they were adequately prepared for developing, managing, and teaching their online or hybrid course, to facilitate student success in the course. | Faculty who were teaching at least one course in a DE modality were surveyed in fall 2019 (34 out of 48 faculty responded to the survey). In spring 2020 the survey responses were analyzed.   * 94% of respondents agreed or strongly agreed that they were adequately prepared to develop their DE course(s). * 100% agreed or strongly agreed that they were adequately prepared to teach their DE course(s). * 100% agreed or strongly agreed that they were adequately prepared to manage their DE course(s). * 49% reported they had been teaching in a DE modality for 5 or more years, while the remaining respondents said they had been teaching for less than 5 years. * 33% said they taught in a DE modality at another college before teaching a DE course for PC. * 68% reported that they had successfully completed coursework/training in online teaching within the past three years. * 60% reported that they had successfully completed training in the use of Canvas within the past three years. * 52% reported that they had not utilized resources located in the CIT Website within the past year. * A solicitation for ways to improve support for faculty resulted in 63% saying no changes needed. Other comments mentioned a need for more support of rubric alignment including compensation for faculty, keeping faculty informed of add-on or new tools available in Canvas, keeping faculty informed of training opportunities. | Based on the survey responses it appears important to continue offering/expanding training opportunities. There is also a need to bring more awareness to faculty of the training and resources already available to them. Many also expressed a desire for more help in aligning their courses to the rubric, including help with compensation for that work.  Action has been taken on most of the items listed, including the following:   * Drastically expanded online faculty training to the point of having nearly all faculty employed at PC fully trained to teach online/hybrid by the beginning of fall 2021. * Notifications of training opportunities disseminated via email and posted on the CIT Website on a regular basis. * Major revisions have been done to the online course template and promoting it on the CIT Website. * Local POCR began during the spring 2021 term with funding for 3 courses. |
| 2. Online and hybrid students will report that they regularly received academically related communication from their instructor, and were given opportunities to interact with classmates in their online/hybrid class, to facilitate their successful completion of the course. | A survey of online students was planned for fall of 2020. However, due to the Covid-19 impact on the DE Program, and to the atypical makeup of DE students, the survey has been postponed. |  |

**Program Analysis and Trends**:

This program review has been compiled with the assistance of the Distance Education Committee.

***Data Review***

Before we examine the data, it must be noted that 2019-20 and 2020-21 were not typical years. It was during the middle of the spring 2020 semester that, due to Covid-19, the college moved nearly all of its classes to a DE modality. Classes in fall 2020 and spring 2021 were also conducted primarily as DE courses. Therefore, statistics such as enrollment in DE courses and sections offered in a DE modality during these semesters are artificially inflated. It is less clear how other statistics, such as success and persistence, were affected by the lack of face-to-face class options for students during these uncharacteristic semesters.

The following is a comparison of the total number of DE course sections offered in the fall term during the last five years:

* **1**Fall 2017, 49 DE course sections
* **1**Fall 2018, 80 DE course sections
* **2**Fall 2019, 75 DE course sections
* **2**Fall 2020, 485 DE course sections
* **2**Fall 2021, 207 DE course sections

As mentioned earlier, the fall 2020 term was conducted almost entirely online due to the continuing health emergency from Covid-19. As we get further away from the health emergency, we expect the DE course numbers to get closer to pre-Covid figures.

Success and completion rates for students in DE courses has seen a gradual improvement over the past five years. In the most recent year, 2020-21, success and completion rates in DE courses were higher than they were in traditional courses. In fact, the success rate for DE courses was 6% higher than traditional courses in 2020-21. In the table below, you can see the trends for success and completion during the past five years.

| Academic Year | DE Success Rates**3** | DE Completion Rates**3** |
| --- | --- | --- |
| 2016-17 | 69% | 87% |
| 2017-18 | 73% | 89% |
| 2018-19 | 74% | 89% |
| 2019-20 | 74% | 87% |
| 2020-21 | 75% | 90% |

As for student enrollment in DE courses there was a rapid increase of 287%**3** in the past five years, from 3,569**3** enrollments in 2016-17 to 13,829**3** enrollments in 2019-20. Again, we can attribute this increase to nearly all classes transitioning to a DE modality beginning about midway through the spring 2020 term.

***Changes in Program over Last Five Years***

The Distance Education (DE) Program at Porterville College (PC) has experienced some dramatic changes during the past five academic years (2016-17 through 2020-21), and not all of the changes are due to Covid-19. In 2016, the College transitioned from Moodle to the Canvas learning management system (LMS). Since that time, there has been a steady increase in usage of Canvas, not only by DE courses, but by on-campus courses as well. During fall 2016, just 13% of the classes were using their provided Canvas sites while in fall 2021, approximately 91%**4** of the 480 course sections being offered (in all modalities) were using their Canvas shells. Since many of our DE students have either previously taken classes on campus or concurrently do so, having this kind of saturation of use of the same e-learning environment makes transitioning from one class e-learning setting to another much easier for our students.

When on-campus classes were abruptly stopped in March 2020 (with the exception of a very few nursing courses), there was an immediate need to rapidly train instructors on the use of Canvas and other technology tools, as well as help them with the pedagogical shift to distance education. This quick transition was aided by a handful of people including the Educational Media Design Specialist (EMDS) and the faculty members of the DE Committee. The DE Committee itself held an emergency meeting to plan for training. The DE Committee faculty and the EMDS held live training events via Web conferencing (Zoom) over the course of several days in March 2020. Since only the barebones could be taught in these 3-hour training sessions, faculty were encouraged to go through the complete online training certification which the college already had in place for its online instructors. DE Committee faculty helped facilitate these training sessions, along with the EMDS who normally facilitated them, getting the bulk of instructors through the certification by the beginning of the fall 2020 semester. In total, the college conducted 23 DE certification training sessions from March 2020 through August 2021. In addition to this required training, a group of faculty began offering a live 30-minute webinar (Quick Tips) on various online instructional topics. Webinars were held approximately twice per month from July 2020 through to the present.

There were also many opportunities for just-in-time help. The Center for Instructional Technology (CIT) Canvas site was kept up-to-date with a wide variety of online instructional resources, including video tutorials, online course templates, and resources on many of the new tools added during the move to online only courses. The EMDS email address was prominently displayed on the CIT site, and faculty received frequent email messages from the EMDS on various topics about online instruction. The EMDS often met with faculty through Web conferencing (Zoom) when they had questions that benefitted from screen-sharing. As was alluded to, the college added several new instructional technology tools to help instructors with their transition to DE.

When the college moved to Canvas, there was a deliberate focus to improve support services to online students. In 2016, the college began offering online tutoring by purchasing support from NetTutor. NetTutor has continually been offered to students through to the present, but even more options were added in 2019 when the College added its own peer tutors to its online tutoring interface. Also, beginning about this same time, peer tech-support was added to help students who had technical questions with their online classes. Beginning in 2019, the Porterville College counselors began to offer online counseling through a platform called Cranium Café. This tool was extremely useful during the move to all DE instruction. Although the college no longer uses Cranium Café, it still offers online counseling with the use of Zoom web-conferencing. The college has supported academic integrity in its online courses for many years through a subscription with the plagiarism detection services of Turnitin. Expanding on this dedication to academic integrity, the college began utilizing the online proctoring tool, Proctorio, in summer 2018 through to the present. Other support resources available to students includes an online student orientation which the EMDS developed from a core course offered by the CVC-OEI. The EMDS has also created a site within Canvas, called the PC Student Support Hub, that is available to all Porterville College students. This site contains information and links for many of the online support services students can access including online counseling, online tutoring, online library services, and the orientation for online students.

In fall 2018, Porterville College joined the California Virtual Campus-Online Education Initiative (CVC-OEI) Consortium. Membership in the Consortium provides a broad range of services to the College’s DE Program and enables Porterville College students to find classes at other colleges in the consortium if they are not able to find the class they need from PC. This access will aid students in completing their educational goal more quickly. The EMDS was instrumental in writing and submitting the proposal to be admitted into the CVC-OEI Consortium, and now serves as the lead contact to the Consortium for Porterville College. In fall 2019, the College moved to phase one of integration with the CVC-OEI exchange, which means that its enrollment information is live in the exchange. However, a move to phase two has been stalled due to a lack of support for implementation at the district level.

In fall 2018, with coordination from the Distance Education Committee, the EMDS, and the Office of Instruction, the College instituted a new policy in which faculty who will be teaching an online class must have completed training in the use of Canvas, as well as training in the fundamentals of online teaching and learning. This is the certification of online faculty that was mentioned earlier. Since implementing this certification requirement, anecdotal evidence suggests that online courses have become more accessible, equitable, and intuitively designed. Support tickets to Canvas dropped by more than 30%**5** from fall 2018 when training was not yet required for online faculty, to fall 2019 when the online certification was in effect. This could suggest that online faculty were more prepared to use Canvas, and that they were better at applying effective online instructional practices in their classes.

Improvement in online course quality has been a long-term goal for the college and for the CVC-OEI Consortium of which the college belongs. The CVC-OEI Consortium, in cooperation with the California State Academic Senate, created an Online Course Design Rubric and also a peer review program that uses the rubric to evaluate online course quality. In the 2020 updated CVC-OEI Master Consortium Agreement, it stipulates that colleges in the consortium must develop a local peer online course review process. Porterville College actually developed a peer online course review process in fall 2019 (PC-POCR), prior to this directive from CVC-OEI. However, due to lack of funds to support the program, PC-POCR was not implemented until spring 2021. At present, the College is working on becoming a POCR certified campus through the CVC-OEI process.

Although the DE Program has been able to accomplish a great deal without a dedicated budget, there is a growing sense of frustration and uncertainty, among those who work closely with the DE Program, that a smooth running and effective DE Program may not endure without adequate and consistent funding provided by the College. Many of the tools that the College was able to use during the statewide stay-at-home orders were paid for by the California Community College Chancellor’s Office. Moving forward, it will be up to the College to fund these or other similar tools and resources, just to maintain the same level of support and resources for our DE Program.

***Report on Previous Goals***

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Goal | Status/Progress |
| 1. Implement a peer online course review process to align online courses to the CVC-OEI online course rubric. | The process for our local POCR program (PC-POCR) was established in spring 2019. Since then, it has been extremely difficult to get funding to launch the program. In late spring 2021, we were finally able to secure one-time funding from a grant that allowed us to put three courses through PC-POCR. These three courses will be submitted to @ONE to begin the process of Porterville College becoming POCR Certified by @ONE. Stable funding to support PC-POCR long-term is still needed and being pursued. |

***Program Strengths***

As the data suggests, the program has made good progress in addressing student success and completion in online courses. This is likely attributable to many things including more support resources for DE students, increasing familiarity of the LMS by both faculty and students, assigning only those faculty with foundational training in DE to DE courses, DE faculty mentors within most divisions (In 2018, five instructors went through a 12-week course, then passed on what they learned in division meetings, and in other ways served as a DE faculty mentor to their colleagues.), an active and supportive DE Committee, and an EMDS with many years of experience in both DE and in the culture of the College.

The EMDS consistently communicates with DE faculty, providing many resources, tips, and workshops to support DE instruction. The EMDS works to stay up-to-date on the latest tools and services available, and takes advantage of many professional growth opportunities throughout each year. The EMDS has been actively involved in state projects, activities, and professional organization, which helps to inform the work done at the College. As a co-chair of the DE Committee, the EMDS can both receive and pass along knowledge and insights with this group of faculty.

***Areas for Improvement***

The College has clearly made a lot of improvements to its DE Program over the past several years, and yet there is still room for more progress. To begin, a solid foundation would help to ensure that the gains that have been made do not lapse. This foundation could be initiated with a dedicated budget to the DE Program, signaling full institutional support. The financial impact to the program from this is obvious, but just as important but less obvious would be the psychological and emotional impact this would have on those who work in and support the DE Program. This would also mean that energy that was previously spent in trying to find funding for various aspects of DE, could now be put into other DE activities and causes.

Along with a dedicated budget, a solid foundation could be advanced by assigning a new management position to oversee all aspects of the DE Program. Someone holding a management position would be better able to integrate DE across all areas of the campus, they would be a strong advocate for DE, and would be able to take action much more quickly on various aspects of work that otherwise take a longer more circuitous route to completion.

To complement the management aspect of the DE Program, it would be beneficial to have a position that was focused entirely on support and training for faculty (e.g. instructional designer). Faculty report that they want more training opportunities. In addition, the need for transitioning courses to full rubric alignment justifies a position that would provide that instructional design and support. We know that the College has worked hard on implementing its PC-POCR program. This is not only an important element in advancing equity, inclusion, accessibility, and student success, but it also is a required aspect of the College’s membership in the CVC-OEI Consortium. Currently, the college has just five courses aligned to the rubric. To get more involvement from faculty, they will need both instructional design support as well as compensation for the work that it will entail. Here, again, is where a dedicated budget would be helpful in moving this goal forward more quickly.

Although the current EMDS has a master's degree in educational technology and over 20 years of experience in instructional design work, faculty are hesitant to consult with the EMDS regarding matters of instructional design. In speaking with employees in a similar role at other colleges, it is common to hear that faculty prefer that those who work with them on course design be employed as faculty member. Therefore, we feel that adding a part-time faculty position with the role of instructional designer to the Distance Education program would encourage more participation in faculty development opportunities, and also help advance the first goal of this program review.

**Goals**

| Goal(s) | Timeline for completion | Needed resources | Person(s) Responsible | Obstacles to completion (if any) | Mission Statement | Guided Pathways Pillars |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1. Increase the number of fully-online courses aligned to the CVC-OEI online course design rubric, to 20% of the total online sections offered in an average year. | Fall 2024 | Funding for stipends and/or release time | DE Committee | Funding to compensate faculty and faculty reviewers. | 1 | 4 |
| 2. Survey online, hybrid, and hyflex students for SAO #2. | Spring 2023 |  | DE Coordinator |  | 1 | 3 |

**Staffing:**

***Current Staffing Levels***

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Full-time | | Part-time | |
| Faculty | 0 | Faculty | 0 |
| Temporary | 0 | Temporary | 0 |
| Classified | 1 | Classified | 0 |
| Management | 0 | Management | 0 |

***Request for New/Replacement Staff***

|  | Title of Position | Classification  (Faculty, Classified, or Management) | Full or Part  Time | New or Replacement |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Position 1 | Director of Distance Education | Management | Full-time | New |
| Position 2 | Instructional Designer | Faculty (release time & additional contact days) | Part-time | New |

**Justification:**

**Director of Distance Education (Management):** As the College has continued to expand its online, hybrid, and hyflex course offerings there is a growing need to focus on long-term, strategic goals for the DE Program. To effectively plan and manage the future of DE at the college requires a person with managerial influences at the institutional level. The current lack of a managerial position within the DE Program causes bottlenecks and roadblocks to effectively implement and expand the program. This management position would allow the DE Program to develop and implement a strategic plan for the growth, management, and evaluation of DE; assist in coordinating the offering of online and hybrid courses in accordance with state and federal guidelines; assist in establishing local policies pertaining to distance education and ensure they are being followed; provide leadership in promoting effective instructional practices in online and hybrid courses; serve as the Distance Education Coordinator, a liaison to the state Chancellor’s Office; act as key point of contact for the CVC-OEI; manage the College’s Canvas instance; serve on various committees to promote and integrate DE throughout all areas of the college; work collaboratively with students, faculty, staff, and the community to ensure that the College’s DE program is meeting constituent’s needs; work with IT staff to identify, integrate, effectively use, and monitor products and services related to DE; identify and apply for grant opportunities as discovered; and develop and monitor the budget for the DE Program and associated grants;

**Instructional Designer (Faculty, release time & additional contact days):** With the Director of DE position taking over the responsibilities of the DE Coordinator, Canvas Administrator, and the CVC-OEI lead, this is the perfect opportunity to allow a single position to focus on instructional design and faculty support. Currently the EMDS performs all of these functions, but with the recent growth in DE at the college, this position is being challenged to keep up with the workload. With the increasing focus on accessibility, equity, and student success there is a real need for more instructional design and development support. The Instructional Designer (Faculty) will provide individual and group services for faculty in the support of the effective use of the college LMS and other high-quality online learning tools; Research emerging best-practices, trends, products, and services related to distance education; provide assistance with meeting rubric guidelines; provide assistance with creating and incorporating media resources into courses; assist with ensuring courses meet accessibility requirements; ensure courses meet all district, college, state, and federal requirements; teach courses and workshops that help faculty integrate best practices in online and hybrid course pedagogy; assist in ensuring courses meet all local, state, and federal policies; and serve on various committees to ensure faculty distance education needs are being met. This position would be filled by a faculty using release time and additional contact days.

**Resource Requests**

TECHNOLOGY REQUEST

| Technology Need | Justification |
| --- | --- |
| Item 1 | None |

FACILITIES REQUEST

| Facilities Need | Justification |
| --- | --- |
| Item 1 | None |

SAFETY & SECURITY REQUEST

| Safety & Security Need | Justification |
| --- | --- |
| Item 1 | None |

PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT REQUEST

| Professional Development Need | Justification |
| --- | --- |
| Attendance for up to 3 people each year to attend the annual Online Teaching Conference | Being the primary conference for DE faculty and staff in the CCCs, this event exposes some of the best ideas and information pertaining to DE at California’s Community Colleges. Faculty have expressed interest to attend in the past, but were unable to do so because of a lack of funds. |
| Registration for up to 6 people each year to take fee-based courses focused on DE concerns. | The college has had good success in the past with a train the trainer model of support for some elements of its DE Program. Allowing more participation in DE Professional Development courses will allow the College to expand on this successful model. |

**Budget**

|  | Current Budget | Amount of Change | Revised Total |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 2000 (Student Workers Only) | $0 |  | $0 |
| 4000 | $0 | $500 | $500 |
| 5000 | $0 | $30,000 | $30,000 |
| Other | $0 | $20,000 | $20,000 |

**Justification:**

In the past, Distance Education has not had a budget. Therefore, when funds were needed for a DE project, valuable time was spent in searching for a funding source. Due to this situation, many projects have never gotten past the initial concept phase because funding has been an issue. Also, when the pandemic hit and everything went online the state Chancellor’s Office funded many of the technology tools that the College relied on. Going forward, the College will need to pay for those services and resources that have been vital for our online students’ success. To have a healthy and effective DE program, it is necessary that the college commit financial resources to the program. Having an actual budget in place will mean that the DE program will be able to plan for future growth and improvements, and implement those plans.

**4000** - $500 for office supplies and food for faculty workshops.

**5000** - $5,000 annually for training and conferences, including training for peer online course reviewers. $25,000 annually for software licenses, and technology services (e.g. Canvas Studio, Proctorio, NetTutor, etc.)

**Other** - $20,000 to cover the cost of compensating faculty for work on aligning online courses to the CVC-OEI course design rubric.

**ENDNOTES:**

**1** Data is based on records kept by the Educational Media Design Specialist (EMDS) for each semester.

**2** Data is based on the SB 129 report compiled by the KCCD and sent to the state Chancellor’s Office in September 2021.

**3** Data was retrieved through the [KCCD Tableau historical institutional dashboards](https://ir.kccd.edu/data-directory/index.html#nav-historical-institutional-data-dashboards)

**4** Data is based on the enrollment report as of 9/27/2021 and the Canvas “Unused Courses” report on 9/30/2021

**5** Data is based on support ticket reports found on the Canvas Support Administrator’s Dashboard